

Research Progress on the Characteristics and Recovery of Phosphorus from Sludge

Kaixuan Wang¹ , Wei Yu¹ , Zhangwei Cao² , Wen Yue¹ , Xiurong Si¹* and Feng Chen¹

¹Civil Engineering Department, North China Institute of Aerospace Engineering, Langfang 065000, China

²Langfang City Human Resources and Social Security Bureau, Langfang 065000, China

Received: 29/05/2024, Accepted: 05/07/2024, Available online: 08/10/2024

*to whom all correspondence should be addressed: e-mail: hbsixiurong@nciae.edu.cn

<https://doi.org/10.30955/gnj.06215>

Graphical abstract

Abstract

Phosphorus is a non-metallic element essential for all forms of life, and the issue of phosphorus resource scarcity is increasingly gaining attention. Understanding the content and forms of phosphorus in sludge, as well as the technologies for phosphorus recovery from sludge, is of great importance. Firstly, this paper provided a comprehensive overview of various pre-treatment methods (biological, oxidation, acid-base, microwave, ultrasonic, and hydrolysis) for sludge phosphorus recovery, highlighting the potential for combining these techniques to enhance recovery efficiency. Secondly, it introduced the concept of mixed recovery technology for phosphorus in sludge, which involved the strategic arrangement and combination of different treatment technologies. This approach represented a novel and innovative way of addressing the phosphorus recovery challenge. Furthermore, by discussing the effects of various factors on the phosphorus content in sludge, the paper offered an integrated perspective on the complex interplay of these factors, facilitating a more nuanced understanding of the phosphorus recovery process. This review provides a good reference for recovery processes of sludge phosphorus, enabling engineers to select the most appropriate techniques based on specific project requirements.

Keywords: Phosphorus Characteristics, Sludge, Phosphorus Release, Phosphorus Recovery

1. Introduction

Phosphorus is an essential nutrient for all living organisms, particularly for crop growth. However, the global scarcity of phosphorus resources presents a significant concern (Cooper *et al.* 2011), estimated to sustain human usage only until the end of this century. Therefore, it is of utmost necessity to conserve phosphorus resources and find viable pathways for their recovery. In human production and daily life, a substantial amount of phosphorus enters wastewater treatment plants along with sewage, and approximately 1/6 of the phosphorus from phosphate rock mining also ends up in wastewater treatment facilities via industrial wastewater (Cordell *et al.* 2009). Consequently, the recovery of phosphorus from sewage sludge has become an important method for phosphorus resource conservation. In particular, waste activated sludge can contain up to 10% of its dry weight in phosphorus, making it a significant source of this nutrient (Tchobanoglus *et al.* 2003). The efficient recovery of phosphorus from sludge presents a current challenge. This paper summarized and compared the characteristics and recovery methods of phosphorus in sludge and discussed future development directions.

2. The Influencing Factors and Forms of Phosphorus in Sludge

2.1. Content and Forms of Phosphorus in Sludge

The total phosphorus content in sludge is approximately 17.3±5.1g/kg (Wang *et al.* 2018). Phosphorus in sludge exists in two forms: inorganic phosphorus and organic phosphorus. In dehydrated sludge, inorganic phosphorus accounts for 60% to over 90% of the total phosphorus content, primarily existing in mineral forms such as pyrophosphate, polyphosphate, orthophosphate, and calcium/aluminum-phosphate. Inorganic phosphorus is further divided into apatite and non-apatite forms, with the former mainly combining in the form of Ca-P and the latter primarily combining with Fe/Al/Mn oxides or hydroxides (Wang *et al.* 2023). Organic phosphorus accounts for 10% to 35% of the total phosphorus content in sludge, mainly existing in the form of orthophosphate monoesters, orthophosphate diesters, adenosine triphosphate, and adenosine diphosphate α-phosphates. In wastewater treatment plants, the proportion of inorganic phosphorus gradually increases in sludge produced from primary settling tanks, secondary settling tanks, and digesters

Kaixuan Wang, Wei Yu, Zhangwei Cao, Wen Yue, Xiurong Si and Feng Chen (2024), Research Progress on the Characteristics and Recovery of Phosphorus from Sludge, *Global NEST Journal*, **26**(9), 06215.

(Kwapinski *et al.* 2021). The forms of phosphorus in sludge are directly related to the phosphorus removal methods employed by municipal wastewater treatment plants. In 2001, the European Commission proposed a unified procedure for phosphorus extraction, defining five identifiable forms of phosphorus: total phosphorus (TP), organic phosphorus (OP), inorganic phosphorus (IP), nonapatite inorganic phosphorus (NAIP), and apatite phosphorus (AP). The five forms of phosphorus in sludge have the following relationships: $IP = NAIP + AP$, $TP = IP +$ OP. IP is the predominant form of phosphorus, accounting for 64.42% to 83.01% of TP; NAIP is the main form of inorganic phosphorus, accounting for over 63% of IP (Zhu *et al.* 2014).

2.2. The Influence of Different Factors on the Forms of Phosphorus in Sludge

The forms of phosphorus in sludge vary with different treatment methods; both wastewater treatment (including phosphorus removal methods and the composition of the original wastewater) and sludge treatment influence the forms of phosphorus.

During the wastewater treatment process, the phosphorus contained in the wastewater impacts the outcome; additionally, different wastewater treatment technologies result in various forms of phosphorus in the subsequent sludge, such as the combination of metal ions in the wastewater with phosphates (Zhang and Kuba, 2014).

Sludge treatment technologies lead to various forms of phosphorus, causing a decrease in OP and polyphosphates (poly-P), and an increase in IP (Liu *et al.* 2019). Acid treatment reduces the content of non-apatite phosphorus (e.g., iron and aluminum phosphates) and apatite phosphorus (calcium phosphate), whereas alkaline treatment decreases phosphate content and increases apatite phosphorus levels. Additionally, thermal treatment processes yield various effects. Hydrothermal (HT) treatment not only reduces OP and poly-P and increases IP but also alters the distribution of IP subtypes, namely, Fe\P and Ca\P distributions. The higher the temperature in HT treatment, the greater the production of Ca\P (Biswas *et al.* 2020). After incineration, the phosphorus in sludge ash primarily exists as Fe4(P4O12)³ and Al(PO3)³ (Biswas *et al.* 2009); varying incineration temperatures significantly influence the transformation of phosphorus forms (Xiao *et al.* 2021). Sludge incineration typically occurs at about 850°C, where phosphorus exists as volatile oxides in the flue gas and condenses into P_4O_{10} compounds upon cooling to 400~600°C (Meng *et al.* 2019). Factors influencing the migration and transformation of phosphorus during the pyrolysis process include sludge characteristics and heating rate, among others (Zhang, 2020). Specifically, as sludge particle size decreases, AP content increases, and when the particle size exceeds 37.5μm, NAIP content tends to decrease (Li *et al.* 2017). Pyrophosphates are found in slow pyrolysis biochar produced at temperatures between 300~700°C, whereas orthophosphates are absent in the rapid carbonization products of sludge at 350°C (Uchimiya *et al.* 2015).

2.3. Measurement Methods for Different Phosphorus Components in Sludge

The primary research approach for detecting phosphorus in sludge involves converting phosphorus into watersoluble phosphorus compounds (Zeng *et al.* 2023), followed by measuring its content. For example, Zhou Xuhong *et al.* (Zhou and Cao, 2005) melted sludge samples with sodium hydroxide at high temperatures to convert all phosphorus-containing organic compounds into soluble orthophosphates; Chen Guomei *et al.* (Chen, 2006) used potassium persulfate digestion to convert phosphorus into orthophosphates; Kuai Lijun *et al.* (Kuai *et al.* 2019) employed microwave digestion to transform TP in sludge into orthophosphates. In all cases, the TP content determination was conducted using the ammonium molybdate spectrophotometric method.

Figure 1. Sequential Extraction of Phosphorus

The measurement methods for different types of phosphorus in sludge generally involve phosphorus fractionation extraction followed by determination using the molybdenum blue method, as illustrated in **Figure 1**. This method can be economical, rapid, and accurate identify the types of phosphorus. However, the qualitative analysis of phosphorus species may lack clarity, affecting the accuracy of subsequent quantitative analysis (Yu *et al.* 2021). The determination of phosphorus components can also be conducted using specific instrumental analysis methods, such as X-ray diffraction (XRD), $31P$ nuclear magnetic resonance spectroscopy, and X-ray absorption near edge structure (XANES) spectroscopy. Compared to colorimetric methods, these instrumental analyses can provide more detailed information on species and components. However, the use of inappropriate pretreatment methods may result in the loss of key phosphorus species (Yu *et al.* 2021). Currently, an improved ³¹P nuclear magnetic resonance method can prevent the hydrolysis of polyphosphates during characterization (Staal et al. 2019), and an enhanced PL_{2,3}-edge XANES method can identify the subtypes of IP and OP more accurately (Colocho *et al.* 2020).

3. Current Status of Phosphorus Recovery Technologies from Sludge

3.1. Pre-treatment Technologies for Phosphorus Recovery from Sludge

Pre-treatment technologies for phosphorus recovery involve using biological, oxidation, acid-base, microwave, ultrasonic, and hydrolysis methods to facilitate the **Table 1.** Pre-treatment Technologies for Phosphorus Recovery from Sludge

breakdown of extracellular polymeric substances and cell lysis in sludge. This process leads to the release of organic matter, nitrogen, phosphorus, and other substances, making them more accessible for subsequent phosphorus recovery. Currently, the primary pre-treatment technologies for phosphorus recovery from sludge were summarized in **Table 1**.

3.2. Phosphorus Recovery Technologies from Sludge

Phosphorus recovery technologies from sludge involve methods to recover phosphorus released into the supernatant after pre-treatment, utilizing adsorption, ion **Table 2.** Main Technologies for Phosphorus Recovery from Sludge exchange, membrane filtration, and chemical or struvite precipitation techniques. The primary technologies for phosphorus recovery from sludge were summarized in **Table 2**.

3.3. New Technologies for Phosphorus Recovery from Sludge

3.3.1. Recovery of Sludge Phosphorus in the Form of Vivianite

Vivianite, a ferrous (Fe(II)) phosphate mineral, was discovered during the anaerobic digestion (AD) of wastewater sludge (Wilfert *et al.* 2016). In a reducing environment rich in organic matter, Fe(III) is reduced to

Fe(II) by dissimilatory iron-reducing bacteria, converting organic phosphorus into phosphates (Rothe *et al.* 2016). Subsequently, the free Fe(II) combines with phosphates to form vivianite, as illustrated in **Figure 2**. Vivianite is widely utilized as the final phosphorus product in phosphorus recovery from iron-rich sludge (Hu *et al.* 2023) and can serve as a slow-release fertilizer. Its efficiency is significantly superior to that of calcium phosphate, positioning it as an ideal alternative to traditional fertilizers. Additionally, vivianite serves as a fundamental source for manufacturing lithium iron phosphate (LiFePO4) and is used in lithium battery production (Zhao *et al.* 2023).

Figure 2. Formation of Vivianite in Iron and Phosphorus-Rich Solutions

At present, vivianite formation in the AD of sludge is hindered by the low molar ratio of Fe/P in sludge. Magnetic biochar (MBC) is added as an external iron source during the AD process, altering the iron/phosphorus concentration in the sludge. MBC enhances the anaerobic digestion process of hydrothermally pre-treated sludge, offering a novel technology for recovering sludge phosphorus in the form of vivianite, as depicted in Figure 3. The most favorable iron/phosphorus molar ratio for vivianite formation ranges from 1.5 to 3. Furthermore, MBC, with its large surface area and rich porosity, offers enhanced adsorption capacity for phosphates and additional growth sites for microorganisms (like Fe(III) reducing bacteria), facilitating the combination of phosphates with Fe(II) and thus promoting vivianite

formation (Liu et al. 2022). HT can hydrolyze cellulose to glucose, and subsequent glucose hydrolysis generates reactive furfural derivatives, which can reduce Fe(III) to Fe(II) (Jiang et al. 2015). The most suitable conditions for forming the maximum amount of vivianite include HT pretreatment at 135°C, the addition of MBC, and ten days of anaerobic digestion (Liu et al. 2022).

3.3.2. Anaerobic Fermentation Combined with Sulfate Reduction (AF-SR) System for Phosphorus Recovery

The AF-SR system enables the simultaneous release of polyphosphates and iron-phosphates from wasted activated sludge. It has been revealed that the total phosphorus release rate primarily depends on the generation of sulfides (Hu *et al.* 2019). The environmental conditions of the AF process are conducive to the growth of sulfate-reducing bacteria (SRB) (Weng *et al.* 2015). Concurrently, the volatile fatty acids produced by AF can serve as a carbon source for SRB, and the sulfides produced by SRB can be consumed by iron, preventing the accumulation of H2S and its inhibitory effects on SRB (Hu *et al.* 2019).

Combining anaerobic digestion of wasted activated sludge with in-situ sulfate reduction offers an alternative method for recovering phosphates from precipitates containing iron phosphate. This method can utilize waste streams containing sulfates, such as bagasse or wastewater from paper mills, as auxiliary raw materials (Rodrigues and Hu, 2017). Phosphorus recovery can be achieved through two strategies (Likosova *et al.* 2013): the first involves directly treating iron-containing pre-coagulated wasted activated sludge or synthetic iron phosphate suspensions with NaHS or Na2S, which releases phosphates from solid precipitates into the liquid phase. The second method promotes the sulfate reduction process under anaerobic conditions through sulfate-reducing bacteria, thereby releasing phosphates from wasted activated sludge into the liquid phase. This method not only increases the concentration of phosphates in the liquid phase but also maintains the anaerobic digestion process in a suppressed and stable state. Although this approach may lead to a decrease in methane production, it ensures that the output remains at a stable level. Phosphate recovery is economically feasible, but it requires integration with energy, organic matter, or other resources for the comprehensive utilization of energy-rich sludge (Lippens and De Vrieze, 2019).

3.3.3. Alkali Combined with Microwave Pre-treatment of Sludge and Cross-linked Polymer for Phosphorus Recovery

Combining alkali and microwave pre-treatment of sludge, followed by adding methyl triethoxysilane (MTAC) to recover organic matter and nitrogen-phosphorus in the supernatant, represents a novel approach to sludge phosphorus recovery. MTAC can cross-link with water to create polyorganosiloxanes, which exhibit good biocompatibility (Grabitz *et al.* 2020). The silanol groups, produced through the hydrolysis of alkoxy groups, can attach to inorganic materials via covalent bonds (Wang *et* *al.* 2018), making them effective for phosphorus recovery. Alkali treatment, a widely used chemical pre-treatment method, is often combined with other processes. The thermal and non-thermal effects generated by microwaves can efficiently break down sludge. Therefore, the combination of alkali and microwave pre-treatment offers significant potential. The release of phosphorus through alkali treatment combined with microwave radiation increased by up to 25.13% compared to alkali treatment alone (Dai *et al.* 2023). Ultimately, combining alkali and microwave pre-treatment with cross-linked polymer technology recovers substances such as phosphorus from the sludge supernatant in the form of flocculated aggregates. The resulting flocculated aggregates, rich in organic components and nitrogen-phosphorus nutrients, with abundant surface pores and stability, show potential as slow-release carbon sources, fertilizers, and soil conditioners (Dai *et al.* 2023).

3.3.4. Acidic Phosphorus Recovery (APR) Process

Ruo-hong Li *et al.* (Li *et al.* 2019) developed a novel biological treatment process named the APR process, which effectively combines trivalent Fe(III)-based chemical phosphorus removal technology with Membrane Bioreactor (MBR) technology. This approach aims to enhance wastewater treatment efficiency and recover phosphorus from sludge effectively. This process uses an environmentally friendly approach to recover phosphorus from iron-containing sludge produced by the Chemical Phosphorus Removal (CPR) and CPR-MBR treatment processes(Lin *et al.* 2017). Compared to the traditional CPR method, the APR process extracts and recovers phosphorus from iron-containing sludge by co-fermenting it with kitchen waste to produce acid. This synergistic fermentation process takes place under acidic conditions, where trivalent Fe(III) is reduced to divalent Fe(II) through dissimilatory reduction. This leads to the dissolution of iron-phosphorus complexes in sludge and the release of phosphorus (Li *et al.* 2019). This process effectively transforms waste into valuable resources, offering a sustainable solution for sludge phosphorus recovery.

3.3.5. FeCl3-Assisted Hydrothermal Carbonization (HTC) Process for Sludge Treatment

The FeCl3-assisted HTC process for sludge treatment selectively leaches AP and recovers phosphorus as KMgPO₄·6H₂O. During the HTC process, organic phosphorus, polyphosphates, and pyrophosphates are converted into orthophosphates (Li *et al.* 2019). The abundant presence of apatite and other calcium salts in sludge hinders effective phosphorus recovery. Adding ferric chloride creates an appropriate acidic condition for dissolving AP and also immobilizes the dissolved phosphorus to form NAIP (Li *et al.* 2020). Utilizing the FeCl₃assisted HTC process transfers and fixes orthophosphates into hydrochar, facilitating sewage sludge reduction. Phosphorus on the hydrochar is then extracted into the aqueous phase and recovered as K-struvite (Li *et al.* 2020). This technology standardizes phosphorus extraction conditions from hydrochar, achieving a total phosphorus extraction efficiency of 96.1%. Introducing amphoteric

hydroxide masking agents and external magnesium recovers over 92% of the system's total phosphorus as Kstruvite. Additionally, this treatment method hydrolyzes the organic matter in the sewage sludge, resulting in a sludge volume reduction of approximately 43-55%.

4. Conclusion

Given the global depletion of phosphorus resources, the phosphorus shortage has emerged as a critical issue. Sludge, a significant reservoir of phosphorus, is continuing to attract attention. Nonetheless, existing technologies for phosphorus recovery from sludge are challenged by high costs, unstable recovery efficiency, and the risk of secondary pollution. Consequently, further improvements and innovations are required as follows:

(1) A deeper understanding of the intrinsic mechanisms and the organic integration of various technologies for a complementary and multidimensional approach could lead to more efficient and stable phosphorus recovery.

(2) The focus should extend beyond the technology for recovering phosphorus from sludge to optimizing the wastewater treatment systems of sewage treatment plants. By leveraging modern technologies, integrating the entire sewage sludge treatment with intelligent control systems, and utilizing big data models, real-time monitoring and optimization of the entire treatment process can be realized. This approach would enhance the overall efficiency and economic benefits of phosphorus recovery and facilitate the comprehensive utilization of resources.

(3) With the expanding market for sludge-derived phosphorus, technological updates and supportive policies are necessary. Strengthening the cooperation between governments and enterprises to jointly address the global phosphorus resource issue is crucial.

Acknowledgments

This research was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (No. 51808008), 2024 University-level Graduate Innovation Funding Program (YKY-2024-31), (YKY-2024- 33).

References

- Ahmad, A. A., and Idris, A. (2014), Release and recovery of phosphorus from wastewater treatment sludge via struvite precipitation, *Desalination and Water Treatment*, **52**(28-30), 5696-5703.
- Awual, M. R., Jyo, A. (2011), Assessing of phosphorus removal by polymeric anion exchangers, *Desalination*, **281**, 111-117.
- Biswas B. K., Inoue K., Harada H., Ohto K., and Kawakita H. (2009), Leaching of phosphorus from incinerated sewage sludge ash by means of acid extraction followed by adsorption on orange waste gel, *Journal of Environmental Sciences*, **21**(12), 1753-1760.
- Chen G. M. (2006), Determination of total phosphorus in urban sludge by ammonium molybdate spectrophotometric method, *China Water & Wastewater*, **22**(2), 85-86.
- Chen, Y., Jiang, S., Yuan, H., Zhou, Q., and Gu, G. l (2007), Hydrolysis and acidification of waste activated sludge at different pHs, *Water Research*, **41**(3), 683-689.
- Colocho Hurtarte, L.C., Santana Amorim, H.C., *et al.* (2020), A novel approach for the quantification of different inorganic and organic phosphorus compounds in environmental samples by PL2, 3-edge X-ray absorption near-edge structure (XANES) spectroscopy, *Environmental science & technology*, **54**, 2812–2820.
- Cooper J, Lombardi R, Boardman D, *et al.* (2011), The future distribution and production of global phosphate rock reserves, *Resources, conservation and recycling*, **57**, 78-86.
- Cordell D, Drangert J O and White S (2009), The story of phosphorus: global food security and food for thought, *Global environmental change*, **19**(2), 292-305.
- Dai, Q.C., Zhang, R.L., Yin, J., *et al.* (2023), Alkali combined with microwave pretreatment of sludge and cross-linked polymer recovery of organics, nitrogen, and phosphorus from supernatant, *Environmental Chemistry*, **42**(04), 1249-1259.
- Ding, Y. Y., Yu, H. Y., Dai, X. H. (2022), Research progress on phosphorus in sludge and its recovery technology, *China Water & Wastewater*, **38**(16), 29-34.
- Dong, B., Gao, J., Chen, S. S., *et al.* (2020), Main influencing factors and intensification of anaerobic digestion of residual sludge in China, *Environmental Science*, **41**(7), 3384-3391.
- Fang, Z., Liu, F., Li, Y., Li, B., Yang, T., and Li, R. (2021), Influence of microwave-assisted pyrolysis parameters and additives on phosphorus speciation and transformation in phosphorusenriched biochar derived from municipal sewage sludge, *Journal of cleaner production*, **287**, 125550.
- Fu, M.Y., Chen, H.B., Li, H.J., *et al.* (2019), The effect of microwave radiation on physiological functions, *Journal of Jilin Medical College*, **3**, 213-216.
- Grabitz, E., Reich, M., Olsson, O., *et al.* (2020), Using structure biodegradability relationships for environmentally benign design of organosilicons-An experimental comparison of organosilicons and their carbon analogues, *Sustainable Chemistry and Pharmacy*, **18**, 100331.
- Gutierrez, O., Park, D., Sharma, K. R., and Yuan, Z. (2010), Iron salts dosage for sulfide control in sewers induces chemical phosphorus removal during wastewater treatment, *Water Research*, **44**(11), 3467-3475.
- Hu P., Liu J., Wu L., *et al.* (2019), Simultaneous release of polyphosphate and iron-phosphate from waste activated sludge by anaerobic fermentation combined with sulfate reduction, *Bioresource technology*, **271**, 182-189.
- Hu, S.G., Zhang, J., Yang, W.L. (2023), Research progress on phosphorus recovery from sewage sludge incineration ash based on wet chemical technology, *Energy Environmental Protection*, **37**(05), 86-98.
- Jiang Y., Yang L., Bohn C., *et al.* (2015), Speciation and kinetic study of iron promoted sugar conversion to 5 hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) and levulinic acid (LA), *Organic Chemistry Frontiers*, **2**, 1388–1396.
- Kwapinski, W., I. Kolinovic, and J. J. Leahy. (2021), Sewage sludge thermal treatment technologies with a focus on phosphorus recovery: a review, *Waste and Biomass Valorization*, **12**(11), 5837-5852.
- L. Kuai, J. Hao, X. Kong, *et al.* (2019), Determination of total phosphorus concentration in urban sludge by microwave digestion-phosphomolybdenum blue spectrophotometric

method, *Chinese Journal of Inorganic Analytical Chemistry*, **9**(5), 25-29.

- Li L., Pang H., He J., *et al.* (2019), Characterization of phosphorus species distribution in waste activated sludge after anaerobic digestion and chemical precipitation with Fe³⁺ and Mg²⁺, *Chemical Engineering Journal*, **373**, 1279-1285.
- Li R., Teng W., Li Y., *et al.* (2017), Potential recovery of phosphorus during the fluidized bed incineration of sewage sludge, *Journal of Cleaner Production*, **140**, 964-970.
- Li, R., Wang, W., Li, B., *et al.* (2019), Acidogenic phosphorus recovery from the wastewater sludge of the membrane bioreactor systems with different iron-dosing modes, *Bioresource technology*, **280**, 360-370.
- Li, S., Zeng, W., Jia, Z., *et al.* (2020), Phosphorus species transformation and recovery without apatite in FeCl3-assisted sewage sludge hydrothermal treatment, *Chemical Engineering Journal*, **399**, 125735.
- Likosova, E. M., Keller, J., Rozendal, R. A., *et al.* (2013), Understanding colloidal FeSx formation from iron phosphate precipitation sludge for optimal phosphorus recovery, *Journal of colloid and interface science*, **403**, 16-21.
- Lin, L., Li, R. H., Yang, Z. Y., Li, X. Y. (2017), Effect of coagulant on acidogenic fermentation of sludge from enhanced primary sedimentation for resource recovery: comparison between FeCl³ and PACl, *Chemical Engineering Journal*, **325**, 681-689.
- Lin, X., Lan, L., Altaf, R., Han, Z., Ye, Z., Zhu, S., and Liu, D. (2020), Simultaneous P release and recovery from fish farm sludge using a Zr-modified magnetic adsorbent treated by ultrasound, *Journal of cleaner production*, **250**, 119529.
- Lippens, C., De Vrieze, J. (2019), Exploiting the unwanted: Sulphate reduction enables phosphate recovery from energyrich sludge during anaerobic digestion, *Water Research*, **163**,114859.
- Liu J C. (2009), Recovery of phosphate and ammonium as struvite from semiconductor wastewater, *Separation and Purification Technology*, **64**(3), 368-373.
- Liu, J., Deng, S., Qiu, B., Shang, Y., Tian, J., Bashir, A., *et al.* (2019), Comparison of pretreatment methods for phosphorus release from waste activated sludge, *Chemical Engineering Journal*, **368**, 754–763.
- Liu, Y. X., Xia, Q. X., Li, W. H. (2023), Research progress on the recovery of vivianite from sludge, Environmental *Science and Technology*, **46**(09), 129-137.
- Liu, Y., *et al.* (2022), Enhanced phosphorus recovery as vivianite from anaerobically digested sewage sludge with magnetic biochar addition, *Sustainability*, **14**(14), 8690.
- Mei, X., Cheng, H. L., Zhang, Y. C., *et al.* (2013), Selective recovery of phosphorus from the anaerobic digestion liquid of sludge by ion exchange method, *Chinese Journal of Environmental Engineering*, **7**(09), 3319-3326.
- Meng, X., Huang, Q., Xu, J., Gao, H., and Yan, J. (2019), A review of phosphorus recovery from different thermal treatment products of sewage sludge, *Waste Disposal & Sustainable Energy*, **1**(2), 99-115.
- Reis, C. E. R., and Hu, B. (2017), Vinasse from sugarcane ethanol production: better treatment or better utilization? *Frontiers in Energy Research*, 5.
- Rothe, M., Kleeberg, A. and Hupfer, M. (2016), The occurrence, identification and environmental relevance of vivianite in waterlogged soils and aquatic sediments, *Earth-Science Reviews*, **158,** 51–64.
- Schütte, T., Niewersch, C., Wintgens, T., and Yüce, S. (2015), Phosphorus recovery from sewage sludge by nanofiltration in diafiltration mode, *Journal of Membrane Science*, **480**, 74-82.
- Staal, L.B., Petersen, A.B., Jorgensen, C.A., *et al.* (2019), Extraction and quantification of polyphosphates in activated sludge from waste water treatment plants by $(31)P$ NMR spectroscopy, *Water Research*, **157**, 346–355.
- Sun, L. P., Tan, J. X., Guo, W. Z., *et al.* (2014), Release and change rules of phosphorus and related indicators under anaerobic conditions in residual sludge, *Ecology and Environmental Sciences*, **02**, 295-299.
- Tchobanoglus G, Burton F, Stensel H D (2003), Wastewater engineering: treatment and reuse, *American Water Works Association*, **95**(5), 201.
- Uchimiya, M., Hiradate, S., and Antal Jr, M. J. (2015), Dissolved phosphorus speciation of flash carbonization, slow pyrolysis, and fast pyrolysis biochars, *ACS Sustainable Chemistry & Engineering*, **3**(7), 1642-1649.
- Wang C, Geng Y, Cheng L, *et al.* (2018), Speciation, mass loadings, and fate of phosphorus in the sewage sludge of China, *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, **25**, 35531-35537.
- Wang Q, Zhang C, Patel D, *et al.* (2020), Coevolution of iron, phosphorus, and sulfur speciation during anaerobic digestion with hydrothermal pretreatment of sewage sludge, *Environmental Science & Technology*, **54**(13), 8362-8372.
- Wang, J. S., Zhao, J. H., Liu, Y. D. (2018), Research progress on sludge reduction technology by ultrasonication, *Journal of Green Science and Technology*, **14**, 124-125.
- Wang, X. X., Lv, S. G., Qiu, Z. F., *et al.* (2010), Comparative study on the dissolution effect of residual sludge by ultrasonic treatment, thermal treatment, and acid-base adjustment, *Environmental Pollution & Control*, **08**, 56-61.
- Wang, X., Li ,Y., Liu, J., *et al.* (2016), Augmentation of proteinderived acetic acid production by heat-alkaline-induced changes in protein structure and conformation, *Water research*, **88**(1), 595-603.
- Wang, Y. Z., Zhang, X. Z., Di, Y. T. (2018), Recent progress and application of silane coupling agents in polymer modification, *New Chemical Materials*, **46**(11), 5-7, 12.
- Wang, Y.B., Feng, J.W., Tan, H.Z., *et al.* (2023), Progress in the transformation and recycling of phosphorus elements in the thermochemical treatment of municipal sewage sludge, *Chemical Industry and Engineering Progress*, **42**(2), 985-999.
- Weng, H., Dai, Z., Ji, Z., Gao, C., and Liu, C. (2015), Release and control of hydrogen sulfide during sludge thermal drying, *Journal of hazardous materials*, **296**, 61-67.
- Wilfert, P., Kumar, P. S., Korving, L., *et al.* (2015), The relevance of phosphorus and iron chemistry to the recovery of phosphorus from wastewater: a review, *Environmental science & technology*, **49**(16), 9400-9414.
- Wilfert, P., Mandalidis, A., *et al.* (2016), Vivianite as an important iron phosphate precipitate in sewage treatment plants, *Water Research*, **104**, 449–460.
- Wojciechowska E. (2005), Application of microwaves for sewage sludge conditioning, *Water Research*, **39**(19), 4749-4754.
- Xiao Y., Zhao R., Xiong Z., *et al.* (2021), Transformation of phosphorous during incineration of sewage sludge: Influence of steam and mineral, *Fuel*, **303**, 121307.
- Xiao, Z., Ren, T. C., Dong, H. H. (2022), Study on sludge treatment methods and phosphorus recovery technology based on

phosphorus recovery, *Jiangxi Chemical Industry*, **38**(06), 15-18.

- Xing, W., Huang, W. M., Li, D. H., *et al.* (2006), Research progress on the mechanism of iron salt phosphorus removal technology and iron salt coagulants, *Water & Wastewater Engineering*, **02**, 88-91.
- Xu, D. C., Zhou, L. J., Yin, K. H., *et al.* (2017), Low-temperature thermal alkali cracking of low organic matter sludge and phosphorus form analysis, *Chinese Journal of Environmental Engineering*, **11**(10), 5621-5629.
- Yu B., Luo J., Xie H., *et al.* (2021), Species, fractions, and characterization of phosphorus in sewage sludge: A critical review from the perspective of recovery, *Science of the Total Environment*, **786**, 147437.
- Yuan, J., Chen, Y., Li, Q., *et al.* (2010), The effect of pH on the release of nitrogen and phosphorus from residual sludge, *China Water & Wastewater*, **26**(1), 96-98.
- Zeng, S. J., Peng, J. X., Sun, X. J., *et al.* (2023), Ultrasonic cracking assisted wet method for determining total phosphorus content in activated sludge, *China Environmental Science*, **43**(7), 3499-3508.
- Zhang Y. (2020), The mechanisms of the effects of calcium-based additives on migration and transformation of phosphorus during sludge pyrolysis. M.S. thesis, Dept. of Energy and Kinetic Energy Eng, HUST, Wuhan, China.
- Zhang, J., Tian, Y., and Zhang, J. (2017), Release of phosphorus from sewage sludge during ozonation and removal by magnesium ammonium phosphate, *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, **24**, 23794-23802.
- Zhang, M.Y., Kuba, T. (2014), Inhibitory effect of metal ions on the poly-phosphate release from sewage sludge during thermal treatment. *Environmental technology*, **35**, 1157–1164.
- Zhang, Q., Solihin, Saito, F. (2009), Mechanochemical synthesis of slow-release fertilizers through incorporation of alumina composition into potassium/ammonium phosphates, *Journal of the American Ceramic Society*, **92**(12), 3070-3073.
- Zhao, W. Y., Cao, J. S., Wang, S. N. (2023), Research progress on phosphorus recovery from wastewater or sludge in the form of vivianite, *Water Purification Technology*, **42**(12), 27-34, 71.
- Zhou X. H. and Cao X. H. (2005), Discussion on the methods for determining total phosphorus in sludge, *Zhejiang Chemical Industry*, **36**(2), 43-44.
- Zhu, X. Y., Yang, H., Gao, C. M. (2014), The influence of phosphorus forms and pH on phosphorus release from residual sludge, *Journal of Shanghai Ocean University*, **23**(1), 102-107.