

# Recovery of nitrogen removal by N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> after nitrite inhibited anammox reaction

# Wen R.<sup>1</sup>, Wei Y.<sup>2</sup> and Zhang W.<sup>1,2,3\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Collaborative Innovation Center for Water Pollution Control and Water Safety in Karst Area, Guilin University of Technology, Guilin 541004, China

<sup>2</sup>Guangxi Key Laboratory of Environmental Pollution Control Theory and Technology for Science and Education Combined with Science and Technology Innovation Base, Guilin University of Technology, Guilin, Guangxi 541004, China

<sup>3</sup>Guangxi Key Laboratory of Environmental Pollution Control Theory and Technology, College of Environmental Science and Engineering, Guilin University of Technology, Guilin 541004, China

Received: 24/12/2020, Accepted: 20/05/2021, Available online: 13/06/2021

\*to whom all correspondence should be addressed: e-mail: 2010053@glut.edu.cn

https://doi.org/10.30955/gnj.003491

# Graphical abstract



# Abstract

A pilot-scale sequencing batch reactor (SBR) for anaerobic ammonium oxidation (anammox) of bacteria culture was used along with a batch experimental reaction device to study the effect of NO<sub>2</sub>-N concentration on the activity of anammox bacteria and the recovery of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> on anammox bacteria after inhibition by high concentrations of NO<sub>2</sub>-N. The optimal influent NO2<sup>-</sup>-N concentration in the pilot-scale reactor was 72.0 mg/L, with its total nitrogen consumption being approximately 40.0 g/d. Influent water NO2<sup>-</sup>-N concentrations greater than 100 mg/L had a serious inhibitory effect on the anammox bacteria. At an influent NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentration of 120.35 mg/L, the addition of 10.0-15.0 mg/L of  $N_2H_4$ , restored the activity of granular anammox bacteria; the total nitrogen consumption was increased by 69.96%. Microbiological analysis showed that a change in NO2-N concentration within the range of 18.87-115.39 mg/L did not affect the microbial population structure of the pilot-scale reactor, wherein Candidatus Kuenenia was the dominant bacterial species. In samples collected at stages A0 (sludge inoculation), A20 (the number indicates the NO2-N concentration, which, in this

stage, was 20 mg/L), A40, A60, A80, and A100, the proportion of *Candidatus Kuenenia* was 27%, 23%, 36%, 26%, 34%, and 33%, respectively.

Keywords: Anammox, pilot-scale, sequencing batch reactor, nitrite,  $N_2H_4$ .

# 1. Introduction

Ammonia nitrogen  $(NH_4^+-N)$  wastewater can be obtained from a wide range of human sources. However, if left untreated or below standard, it is discharged into the environment, which can cause serious eutrophication of water (Brase *et al.*, 2018) this leads to significant changes in the aquatic community structure, thereby influencing the safety of human life and production. Therefore, the development of an efficient and low-cost ammonia nitrogen wastewater treatment process is of great significance for environmental protection and social development.

Anaerobic ammonium oxidation (anammox) is a biological reaction process in which anammox bacteria directly reduces NH4<sup>+</sup>-N into N<sub>2</sub> using NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N as the electron acceptor under anaerobic or anoxic conditions (Kartal et al., 2011; Strous et al., 1999). According to Jetten et al. (2001), in anammox reaction, NO<sub>2</sub>-N and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N were respectively located on the cytoplasmic side of anammox cell membrane and the anammoxosome side of cell membrane. When NO2-N on the cytoplasmic side is reduced to NH<sub>2</sub>OH, it was transported to the anammoxosome side by hydrazine hydrolase, condensed with NH4<sup>+</sup>-N to form N2H4 under its catalysis, and finally reduced to N<sub>2</sub> by hydrazine-oxidising enzyme on the anammoxosome side. And this process is different from nitrification and denitrification (Azhdarpoor et al., 2015; Azhdarpoor et al., 2018). Compared with the traditional nitrogen removal process, the anammox process has the advantages of a high nitrogen removal efficiency, eliminating the need for additional organic carbon sources, low residual sludge outputs, and low operating costs (Chen

Wen R., Wei Y. and Zhang W. (2021), Recovery of nitrogen removal by N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> after nitrite inhibited anammox reaction, *Global NEST Journal*, **23**(2), 249-256.

et al., 2019; Kuenen, 2008; Lackner et al., 2014). Anammox technology has been applied in many fields for ammonia nitrogen wastewater treatment, such as livestock and poultry farming with wastewater (Wang et al., 2019), landfill leachate (Wang et al., 2016), and monosodium glutamate production wastewater (Shen et al., 2012), and has become a research hotspot in the field of ammonia nitrogen wastewater treatment in China (Wen et al., 2020). Although NH4<sup>+</sup>-N and NO2<sup>-</sup>-N are both substrates of the anammox process, anammox bacteria only have a high load capacity for NH4<sup>+</sup>-N; further, high concentrations of NO2<sup>-</sup>-N inhibit the activity of anammox bacteria, which is slow to recover. For instance, Bettazzi et al. found that the inhibition threshold of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N against anammox bacteria in batch experiments was 60 mg/L (Bettazzi et al., 2010). Liu et al. conducted a research in a small integrated anammox process reactor (Zhang et al., 2018) and found that influent NO2<sup>-</sup>-N concentrations higher than 100 mg/L had an inhibitory effect on anammox bacteria (Liu et al., 2020). Egli et al. found that anammox bacteria were completely inactivated when the concentration of NO2-N in the influent reached 185 mg/L (Egli et al., 2001). According to Dietl et al., N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> is an important intermediate product in the metabolic process of anammox bacteria (Dietl et al., 2015). N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> can not only promote the anammox process, but also restore the activity of anammox bacteria inhibited by high concentrations of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N. For example, Yao et al. (2013) studied anammox bacteria in a sequencing batch reactor (SBR), and found that N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> increased the specific growth rate of anammox bacteria and inhibited aerobic ammonia oxidation. The optimal concentration of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> in the influent was 3.99 mg/L, and the corresponding total nitrogen (TN) removal increased from 0.202 ± 0.011 kg N/m<sup>3</sup>/d to 0.370 ± 0.016 kg N/m<sup>3</sup>/d. Moreover, Bettazzi et al. found that adding 2 mg/L of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> could restore 20% activity for anammox bacteria inhibited by high concentrations of NO2<sup>-</sup>-N (Bettazzi et al., 2010).

However, most of the above-mentioned studies were based on the results of small-scale tests obtained from sequential batch experiments, and pilot tests or engineering application data for continuous water inflow have rarely been reported. Anammox bacteria are extremely sensitive to their living environment (Khramenkov et al., 2013; Miodoński et al., 2019; Strous et al., 1998). In pilot-scale and engineering applications, due to changes in the reactor and its operating conditions, relevant research results would likely differ somewhat, or even significantly, from those of small-scale tests. Therefore, to support engineering applications of anammox, in view of the problem that anammox bacteria are inhibited by high concentrations of NO2-N, the recovery effect of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> on the activity of anammox bacteria was tested in a pilot-scale continuous water inflow experiment. Herein, the research object was anammox bacteria cultivated in the laboratory (Jin et al., 2016; Wei et al., 2020), and the concentration gradient was set based on the NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentration of the influent water. Anammox activity was studied by detecting the influent and effluent concentrations of NH4<sup>+</sup>-N and NO2<sup>-</sup>-N, as well as the effluent concentration of TN. A concentration gradient of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> was set in the influent to study the recovery of different concentrations of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> on the activity of anammox bacteria inhibited by high concentrations of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N. High-throughput sequencing and field emission scanning electron microscopy (FE-SEM) were used to analyze the sludge samples of anammox bacteria. The pilot experiment provided a more accurate NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N inhibition threshold for the engineering application of anammox. And the batch experiment provided a concentration reference and theoretical basis for N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> to restore the activity of anammox when it is inhibited by high concentration NO<sub>2</sub><sup>--</sup>N.

#### 2. Materials and methods

#### 2.1. Experimental setup

In this study, a pilot-scale SBR for anammox of bacteria culture was used (Figure 1) along with a batch experiment reactor (Figure 2) (Liu *et al.*, 2019).



Figure 1. Anammox culture reactor



Figure 2. Batch experiment reaction device

The pilot-scale SBR included a distribution tank, an anammox culture reactor, a temperature control system, and an online pH control system. The reaction process is influent, reaction, precipitation and effluent. The influent time was controlled to 40 min, and the reaction time depended on the concentration of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N in effluent. The effluent from the reaction was precipitated in the sedimentation tank for 30 min and then discharged. The reactor was basically a cylindrical barrel with a radius of 60 cm, a height of 150 cm, and an effective volume of 1.5 t. It was wrapped with an insulating cotton layer on the outside to keep the reactor warm and provide a dark environment for the anammox bacteria. The dissolved oxygen (DO) in

the water inlet bucket was controlled below 0.6 mg/L by aeration of nitrogen generator (Strous et al., 1998; Yin et al., 2016). The inlet water was pumped into the bottom of the reactor through the inlet pump. Flow control valves and flow meters were installed in the inlet pipe to monitor and control the inlet water flow in real time. The reactor was filled with 15 cm of activated carbon (The activated carbon was soaked in experimental water before adding) and 0.4 m<sup>3</sup> of polyurethane suspension filler to provide an environment for the attachment and growth of anammox bacteria. The speed of the agitator was controlled at 30.0-40.0 r/min. A sedimentation water tank filled with a polyurethane suspension filler was installed on the inner wall of the reactor. Effluent flowed into the sewage treatment system after sedimentation. The pH online control system pumped 5% H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> solution into the anammox culture reactor by controlling the acid feed pump, keeping the pH of the reactor between 7.0 and 8.0 (Li et al., 2017; Strous et al., 1999). The temperature control system controlled the temperature within the range of 28.0-31.0 with a temperature sensor and heating rod (deGraaf et al., 1996; Isaka et al., 2007).

The reaction device of the batch experiment was designed in the laboratory; it was made of plexiglass, and the volume was 0.5 L (Liu et al., 2019). During the experiment, the device was protected from light to prevent the adverse effects of light on bacteria (Ni et al., 2011). Aeration of nitrogen generator was used to control the DO in the water tank to below 0.6 mg/L (Strous et al., 1998; Yin et al., 2016). pH was controlled between 7.0 and 8.0 using a pH online control system (Li et al., 2017; Strous et al., 1999). Temperature was maintained at  $30.0 \pm 1.0^{\circ}$ C by heating in a water bath (deGraaf et al., 1996; Isaka et al., 2007). The inlet and outlet water were sampled with a peristaltic pump to avoid the DO influence during operation. When water entered, one end of the inlet pipe (silicone hose) was connected to the inlet of the device, where the bottom end of the inlet was placed deep in the sludge layer to prevent oxygen in the air from mixing in the reactor, and the other end was connected to the prepared artificial simulated wastewater. When out of water, the soft silicone tube was gradually moved downward along the side wall of the reactor to take water, and the water outlet was kept sealed during the operation of the reaction device. There were five groups in the batch experiment, each group had three parallel samples, and the running period of each group was 1 d.

#### 2.2. Operational strategies and inoculated sludge

Artificial wastewater was used as the experimental water; its composition is shown in Table 1. The NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N content of the wastewater was provided by NH<sub>4</sub>HCO<sub>3</sub>, and NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N was provided by NaNO<sub>2</sub>. In addition, given amounts of NaHCO<sub>3</sub>, KH<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>, CaCl<sub>2</sub>·2H<sub>2</sub>O, MgSO<sub>4</sub>·7H<sub>2</sub>O, and microbial accelerant (Ruicheng Environmental Protection, Shandong, China) (Liu *et al.*, 2019) were added. The experimental process was divided into two phases. Phase I mainly studied the effect of different influent NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentrations on anammox bacteria activity. Phase II mainly aimed to study the recovery effect of different concentrations of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> on anammox bacteria inhibited by high NO2<sup>-</sup>-N concentrations. The NO2<sup>-</sup>N concentration in the influent of phase I was divided into five concentration gradients of A20, A40, A60, A80, and A100, where the concentration of  $NO_2^{-}N$  was 20 mg/L, 40 mg/L, 60 mg/L, 80 mg/L, and  $\geq$  100 mg/L, respectively. Each phase run for 20 days. Phase II influent N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> was divided into five concentration gradients of B0, B5, B10, B15, and B20, where the concentration of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> was 0 mg/L, 5.0 mg/L, 10.0 mg/L, 15.0 mg/L, and 20.0 mg/L, respectively. Phase I was carried out in the pilot-scale SBR, and phase II was carried out in the batch experimental reaction device. According to the experimental results of phase I, when the concentration of NO2<sup>-</sup>-N in the influent was 103.45-115.39 mg/L (A100), anammox bacteria would be severely inhibited. Therefore, in order to study the recovery effect of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> on anammox bacteria inhibited by high concentration of NO2<sup>-</sup>-N, the concentration of NO2<sup>-</sup>-N in the influent in phase II was set to 120 mg/L.

The inoculated sludge was taken from anaerobic ammonia oxidation sludge cultured in the laboratory of Kumamoto University for more than 1 year for the inoculation of this study, and the load of anaerobic ammonia oxidation bacteria was 0.3 kg N/m<sup>3</sup>/d, and its shape was red granules. In phase I, the sludge inoculation amount and sludge concentration of the pilot-scale SBR of anammox bacteria culture were 3 L and 3000 mg/L, respectively. In phase II, the batch experimental device was inoculated with anammox sludge taken after the completion of the phase I experiment; the inoculation amount and concentration were 100 mL and 2000 mg/L, respectively.

#### 2.3. Quantification methods

During the experiment, DO was measured using a HQ30d portable dissolved oxygen meter (Hach Company, Loveland, CO, USA). The online pH control system was a DPH10AC + DPH-SOC10 instrument (Tianjian Innovation Environmental Technology Co., Ltd., Beijing, China). The temperature control system was a WK-05 + HW-3000 instrument (Hai Cube Refrigeration Equipment Co., Ltd., Shandong, China). NH4<sup>+</sup>-N and NO2<sup>-</sup>-N were determined according to the standard colorimetric method (Jin et al., 2016). NO<sub>3</sub>-N was calculated by subtraction method. TN alkaline potassium persulfate ultraviolet via spectrophotometry (Zhang W. et al., 2015). The concentration of biomass is calculated according to the following method: The anaerobic ammonia oxidizing bacteria mixture was taken from the reactor species, 100 ml of the mixture was centrifuged at 2000 g for 5 min, the supernatant was discarded, the remaining sludge was weighed, and 2 other parallel groups were made, and the average value was taken as the inoculated sludge concentration.

#### 2.4. Microbiological analysis

The sludge samples of anammox bacteria were analyzed by high-throughput sequencing and FE-SEM technology. A soil DNA kit (DNeasy Power Soil DNA Isolation Kit 12888-50, Mo Bio, USA) was used to extract DNA from all the sludge after phase I experiment samples(A0-A100) according to the instructions. The v3-v4 region of the qualified DNA was

-0.896\*\*

341F (5'amplified by PCR using CCCTACACGACGCTCTTCCGATCTG-3') 805R (5'and GACTGGAGTTCCTTGGCACCCGAGAATTCCA-3') primers. amplification, agarose After gel electrophoresis, purification, and quantitative mixing were performed. Shanghai Sangon Biotech (Shanghai) Co., Ltd. was entrusted to complete the subsequent sequencing of the microorganisms. Finally, the gene sequence was compared in the GenBank to analyze the diversity of samples (Liu X. *et al.*, 2020). Sludge samples taken after completing the B10 experiment were analyzed by FE-SEM. In the FE-SEM experiment, the sludge samples were cleaned and then vacuum-dried for 2 h. After adding a gold-plated conductive film, the sludge samples were observed using a Sigma 500 scanning electron microscope (Carl Zeiss, Jena, Germany).

| Fable 1. Composition of | f experimental wastewate | er used in each stage of the experiment | t |
|-------------------------|--------------------------|---|---|
|-------------------------|--------------------------|---|---|

| Phase       | Stage      | NO2 <sup>—</sup> N<br>(mg/L) | NH₄⁺-N<br>(mg/L)        | N₂H₄<br>(mg/L) | NaHCO₃<br>(mg/L)    | KH₂PO₄<br>(mg/L) | CaCl <sub>2</sub> ·2H <sub>2</sub> O<br>(mg/L) | MgSO₄·7H₂O<br>(mg/L) | Microbial<br>accelerant<br>(mg/L) |
|-------------|------------|------------------------------|-------------------------|----------------|---------------------|------------------|--|----------------------|-----------------------------------|
| -           | A20        | 18.87-                       | 14.24 -                 |                | _<br><br>1000       | 25               |  |                      |                                   |
|             |            | 22.95                        | 17.56                   |                |                     |                  |  |                      |                                   |
|             | . 40       | 41.31-                       | 30.12 -                 |                |                     |                  |  |                      |                                   |
|             | A40        | 43.61                        | 35.84                   |                |                     |                  |  |                      | 0.5                               |
|             | 100        | 61.84-                       | 44.85 -                 |                |                     |                  |  |                      |                                   |
|             | A60        | 68.34                        | 48.35                   |                |                     |                  |  |                      |                                   |
|             | A80        | 79.61-                       | 58.96 -                 |                |                     |                  |  |                      |                                   |
|             |            | 86.34                        | 64.35                   |                |                     |                  | 113  | 100                  |                                   |
|             | A100       | 103.45-                      | 71.34 -                 |                |                     |                  |  |                      |                                   |
|             |            | 115.39                       | 90.35                   |                |                     |                  |  |                      |                                   |
|             | B0         |                              |                         | 0              |                     |                  |  |                      |                                   |
|             | B5         | 120.35                       | 91.74                   | 5.0            |                     |                  |  |                      |                                   |
| Ш           | B10        |                              |                         | 10.0           |                     |                  |  |                      |                                   |
|             | B15        |                              |                         | 15.0           |                     |                  |  |                      |                                   |
|             | B20        |                              |                         | 20.0           |                     |                  |  |                      |                                   |
| Table 2. A2 | 20-A100 pe | earson correlati             | on analysis             |                |                     |                  |  |                      |                                   |
| Stag        | ge         |                              | Inf- NO <sub>2</sub> -N |                | NH4 <sup>+</sup> -N | NO <sub>2</sub>  | N  | NO₃ <sup>-</sup> -N  | TN                                |
| A20-A       | 460        | Inf- NO <sub>2</sub> N       | -                       |                | 0.955*              | 0.94             | 7**  | 0.088                | 0.952**                           |

-0.837\*\*

A80-A100 Inf- NO2<sup>-</sup>-N -

\*At the 0.05 level (two-tailed), the correlation is significant.

\*\*At the 0.01 level (two-tailed), the correlation is significant.

# 2.5. Statistical methods

All statistical analyses were performed using SPSS project software. Pearson correlation analysis was performed using Pearson analysis for N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N, NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N, NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>N, TN. The main purpose of stage I was to study the effect of different influent NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentrations on the activity of anammox bacteria, which was divided into two stages for correlation analysis according to the experimental results in order to better reflect the realized results; the main purpose of stage II was to study the recovery effect of different concentrations of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> on anammox bacteria inhibited by high concentrations of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N, and correlation analysis was performed on BO-B15 data.

# 3. Results and discussion

# 3.1. Effect of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N on anammox

The results of Pearson's correlation analysis between the concentration of  $NH_4^+$ -N,  $NO_2^-$ -N and TN consumption and  $NO_3^-$ -N production are shown in Table 2 for the stages A20-A60 and A80-A100. In the A20-A60 stage, there was a significant positive correlation between the influent  $NO_2^-$ -N concentration and the consumption of  $NH_4^+$ -N,  $NO_2^-$ -N and TN. In A80-A100 stage, the influent  $NO_2^-$ -N concentration and the consumption of  $NH_4^+$ -N,  $NO_2^-$ -N and  $ND_2^-$ -N and the consumption of  $NH_4^+$ -N,  $NO_2^-$ -N and  $ND_2^-$ -N and ND\_2^--N and  $ND_2^-$ -N and ND\_2^--N and ND\_2^-

TN were significantly negatively correlated. From the perspective of correlation analysis, the nitrogen consumption increased significantly with the increase of influent  $NO_2$ <sup>-</sup>-N concentration in the A20-A60 stage. But decreased with the increase of influent  $NO_2$ <sup>-</sup>-N concentration in the A80-A100 stage, indicating that the influent  $NO_2$ <sup>-</sup>-N inhibited the activity of anammox reaction in the A80-A100 stage, resulting in the decrease of nitrogen consumption.

0.086

-0.869\*\*

Figure 3 shows the consumption of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N, NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N, and TN in the pilot-scale SBR of anammox bacteria culture under different influent NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentrations. According to the experimental results, in A20, A40, A60, A80, and A100, the average consumption of TN was 7.43 g/d, 23.56 g/d, 39.02 g/d, 37.51 g/d, and 21.31 g/d, respectively; the average consumption of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N was 2.87 g/d, 9.73 g/d, 15.83 g/d, 16.62 g/d, and 8.81 g/d, respectively; and the average consumption of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N was 4.12 g/d, 23.34 g/d, 22.73 g/d, 21.68 g/d, and 12.06 g/d, respectively. The average production of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N was less than 0.5mg/d. During the A20 to A60 stage, when the NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentration of the influent increased from 18.87-22.95 mg/L to 61.84-68.34 mg/L, the consumption of TN in the pilot-scale SBR continuously increased. The average consumption of TN during A40 and A60 relative to A20 increased by 217.09% and 425.17%, respectively, indicating that the increase in the concentration of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N in the influent at this time provided more substrate for anammox bacteria in the reactor, which helped to improve anammox activity. During the A80 to A100 stage, when the NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentration in the influent increased from 79.61-86.34 mg/L to 103.45-115.39 mg/L, the TN consumption of the reactor was significantly reduced. The average consumption of TN in the A100 stage was only 56.81% that of the A80 stage, indicating that the concentration of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N in the influent was too high, and the activity of anammox bacteria was inhibited by high NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentrations.



**Figure 3.** Consumption of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N, NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N, NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N, and TN in the reactor under different influent NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentrations

Figure 4 plots the relationship of NO2<sup>-</sup>-N concentration in the influent of A20, A40, A60, A80, and A100 with the corresponding average consumption of TN. Accordingly, the optimal influent NO2<sup>-</sup>-N concentration of the pilot-scale SBR was approximately 72.0 mg/L, and the corresponding TN consumption was about 40.0 g/d. The NO2-N concentration inhibition threshold obtained in this study was 12.0 mg/L higher than the inhibition threshold (60 mg/L) obtained by Bettazzi et al. in batch experiments (Bettazzi et al., 2010). This may be because the culture mode of the SBR at the pilot scale was more conducive to anammox bacteria, or it may be that the load of NO2-N of the granular anammox sludge (Jin et al., 2016; Wei et al., 2020) inoculated in this experiment was greater than that of the liquid anammox sludge inoculated by Bettazzi et al. (Bettazzi et al., 2010). Lopez et al. used granular anammox sludge in a SBR to treat high-nitrogen wastewater. When the concentration of NO2-N exceeded 100 mg/L, the inhibitory effect of NO2-N on anammox was observed (Lopez et al., 2008), which indicated that granular anammox had a stronger tolerance to changes in the growth environment than liquid anammox.



Figure 4. Relationship between NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentration in influent and TN consumption

# 3.2. Effect of $N_2H_4$ on anammox inhibited by high concentrations of $NO_2^{-}-N$

According to the experimental results of phase I, to study the recovery effect of  $N_2H_4$  on anammox bacteria inhibited by high concentrations of  $NO_2$ <sup>-</sup>-N, the influent  $NO_2$ <sup>-</sup>-N of phase II was set around 120 mg/L.

The results of Pearson correlation analysis of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> concentration on NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N, NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N and TN consumption and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N production are shown in Table 3. In the BO-B15 stage, the concentration of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> in the feed water and nitrogen consumption showed a significant positive correlation. It can be seen that in a certain concentration range, increasing N2H4 concentration is beneficial to the recovery of anammox bacteria activity after being inhibited by NO<sub>2</sub><sup>--N</sup>, among which the recovery of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>--N</sup> consumption is more obvious.

Table.3 BO-B15 pearson correlation analysis

|  | $N_2H_4$     | NH₄⁺-N        | NO₂ <sup>-</sup> -N | NO₃⁻-N        | TN     |  |  |
|--|--------------|---------------|---------------------|---------------|--------|--|--|
| $N_2H_4$   | -            | 0.925         | 0.975*              | -0.804        | 0.965* |  |  |
| *At the 0.05 level (two-tailed), the correlation is significant. |              |               |                     |               |        |  |  |
| **At the 0.0   | )1 level (tw | vo-tailed), t | he correlat         | ion is signif | icant. |  |  |

Figure 5 shows the average daily consumption of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N, NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N, and TN by each batch of reactors. According to the experimental results, the average NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N removal amounts of B0 (0 mg/L), B5 (5.0 mg/L), B10 (10.0 mg/L), B15 (15.0 mg/L) and B20 (20.0 mg/L) were 4.50 mg/d, 5.63 mg/d, 6.81 mg/d, 6.67 mg/d and 5.81 mg/d, respectively. The average removal of NO2<sup>-</sup>-N was 6.13 mg/d, 8.11 mg/d, 11.17 mg/d, 11.82 mg/d, and 10.59 mg/d, respectively; The average removal of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N was kept at 0.23-0.49 mg/d. The average TN removal was 11.02 mg/d, 14.18 mg/d, 18.21 mg/d, 18.73 mg/d, and 16.89 mg/d, respectively. Thus, BO showed the lowest nitrogen removal efficiency. Combined with the data obtained in phase I, the consumption of the substrate by anammox bacteria is greatly reduced in environments with a high concentration of NO2-N (concentration > 100 mg/L); therefore, its activity was inhibited by high concentrations of NO2-N. After the addition of  $N_2H_4$ , the consumption of  $NH_4^+$ -N and  $NO_2^-$ -N in B5, B10, B15, and B20 were significantly greater than that of BO, indicating that N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> had a restorative effect on anammox bacteria activity (Xiao et al., 2015; Zekker et al.,

2012). As shown in Figure 5, after adding N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub>, the consumption of TN by B5, B10, B15, and B20 increased by 28.68%, 65.24%, 69.96%, and 53.27% relative to B0, respectively. When N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub>  $\leq$  15.0 mg/L, the consumption of TN increased, but when N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub>  $\geq$  20.0 mg/L, it decreased. The reason for this result may be that excessive N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> causes hydrazine oxidase to directly oxidize N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> into N<sub>2</sub>, reducing the demand for nitrite oxidoreductase for NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N; alternatively, an excessively high concentration of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub>  $\leq$  15.0 mg/L recovered the activity of anammox bacteria inhibited by high concentrations of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N.



Figure 5. Recovery effect of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> on anammox bacteria

#### 3.3. Microbiological analysis

FE-SEM images of the sludge samples of B10 (N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> = 10.0 mg/L) in phase II are shown in Figure 6. In Figure 6, a large number of spheroid bacteria with a diameter of approximately 1-2  $\mu$ m can be observed. This was consistent **Table 4.** Statistical table of alpha diversity index (5 species)

with the observation results of the external morphological characteristics of mature and highly active anammox bacteria by Kartal *et al.* (Kartal *et al.*, 2007) and Van *et al.* (van Niftrik *et al.*, 2008). Combined with the experimental results of Phase II, after adding 10.0 mg/L of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub>, TN consumption by anammox bacteria in B10 increased by 65.24% relative to B0 (N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> = 0 mg/L), indicating that the anammox bacteria could maintain high activity and good metabolism and reproduction activities.



Figure 6. Anammox morphology observed by FE-SEM

In order to find out the effect of different influent concentrations (A20, A20) on the structure of anaerobic sludge, the influent concentrations of A2 and A2 were further investigated Kuenenia was the main dominant strain in our experiment. In the experiment of stage I, with the increase of NO2- N concentration in influent water, anammox flora also changed gradually. Table 4 reflects the diversity of microbial community through alpha diversity analysis (5 species). The Shannon value showed that the diversity of A60 community was the highest, followed by A20. According to Simpson index, A20 community diversity was the highest, followed by the initial sludge A0 and A60. The coverage rates of all samples were 0.996 and 0.997 respectively, which indicated that the probability of no sequence detected in the samples was low, which also reflected the authenticity of the sequencing results of this experiment.

| Sample ID | ACE     | Chao1    | Shannon | Simpson | Coverage |
|-----------|---------|----------|---------|---------|----------|
| A0        | 1106.70 | 1084.17  | 3.82    | 0.09    | 0.9964   |
| A20       | 1331.79 | 1155.92  | 3.94    | 0.07    | 0.9962   |
| <br>A40   | 1087.27 | 1058.90  | 3.57    | 0.15    | 0.9974   |
| <br>A60   | 1225.42 | 1210.92  | 4.04    | 0.09    | 0.9974   |
| <br>A80   | 1082.77 | 1101. 70 | 3.88    | 0.11    | 0.9968   |
| <br>A100  | 1139.18 | 1119.39  | 3.68    | 0.13    | 0.9973   |
|           |         |          |         |         |          |

Figure 7 shows the changes of N consumption and microbial community under different concentrations in stage a. At the concentration of A40, anammox bacteria accounted for the highest proportion. This also explains the increase in TN consumption compared to the initial sludge (Section 3.1). It can be seen from Figure 7 that with the increase of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentration and incubation time, the proportion of anammox bacteria also changed, from 27.36% of initial sludge to 34.11% of final sludge. However, during this period, the consumption of TN changed differently, A40 (36%) and A80 (34%) accounted for more than

anammox bacteria under A60 (26%), but the TN consumption was the highest under A60 conditions. It can be seen that anammox bacteria are not the only bacteria involved in nitrogen removal in the reactor, and the proportion of armimonadetes-gp5 strain under A60 condition is 2.99%, which is second only to anammox bacteria abundance, and combined with A20 (2.81%), a40 (2.75%), A80 (2.24%) and A100(72%) showed that *Armatimonadetes-gp5* strain had a certain contribution rate of denitrification to the reactor. From Figure 7, it can also be found that the proportion of *Armimonadetes-gp5* 

bacteria in A80 and A100 sludge samples is decreased to a certain extent compared with A20, A40 and A60. Combined with the experimental data of nitrous acid substrate, the nitrite concentrations in A80 and A100 are 80 mg/L and 100 mg/L, respectively. The results showed that the anammox bacteria in the reactor were inhibited to a certain extent, which was consistent with the decreasing trend of the proportion of *Armatimonates-qp5*. Sample A100 represents that the concentration of nitrite in the reactor where the sludge is located is the highest (above 100 mg/L), while the proportion of Armimonadetes-gp5 is the lowest. Therefore, the change of the specific gravity of Armimonadetes-gp5 can be used as one of the reference points for the inhibition of anammox.



Figure 7. Changes of N consumption and microbial community under different concentrations

With the influent nitrite concentration reaching 100mg/L, anammox bacteria accounted for 33%, higher than A60 (26%), which was basically the same as A80 (34%). However, the TN consumption decreased sharply. It can be seen that when the influent nitrite concentration reaches 100mg/L, anammox bacteria account for 33%, which is higher than A60 (26%), which is basically the same as A80 (34%), the activity of anammox will be inhibited, which will affect the overall denitrification rate of the reactor.

In this study, the inhibitory effect of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N on anammox bacteria and the recovery effect of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> on anammox bacterial activity inhibited by high concentrations of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N were studied in a pilot-scale SBR of anammox bacterial culture and a batch experimental device. This study helps address the lack of experimental results for actual engineering applications, and provides a reference and theoretical basis for accelerating engineering applications of the anammox process.

# 4. Conclusions

The optimal influent NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentration of the pilot sequencing batch anammox bacteria culture reactor was 72.0 mg/L, which yielded a TN consumption rate of approximately 40.0 g/d. Influent NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentrations exceeding 100 mg/L had a serious inhibitory effect on the anammox bacteria. However, at an influent NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentration of 120.35 mg/L, adding 10.0-15.0 mg/L of N<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> was observed to restore the anammox bacteria activity, which increased the TN consumption by 69.96%.

According to the results of the microbiological analysis, the anammox bacterium *Candidatus Kuenenia* was the dominant strain in the pilot sequencing batch anammox bacteria culture reactor.

#### Author contributions

Conceptualization, W.Z.; methodology, R.W. and W.Y.; software, R.W. and W.Y.; validation, W.Z.; formal analysis, R.W.; investigation, R.W.; resources, Y.W.; data curation, Y.W.; writing—original draft preparation, Y.W.; writing—review and editing, R.W.; visualization, R.W.; supervision, W.Z.; project administration, W.Z.; funding acquisition, W.Z.

#### Funding

This research was supported by the Guangxi Natural Science Foundation [grant number 2019JJG160002]; Guangxi Science and Technology Planning Project [grant number GuiKe-AD18126018] and the Special Funding for Guangxi "BaGui Scholar" Construction Projects.

#### **Conflicts of interest**

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

#### References

- Azhdarpoor A., Abbasi L. and Samaei M.R. (2018), Investigation of a new double-stage aerobic-anoxic continuous-flow cyclic baffled bioreactor efficiency for wastewater nutrient removal, *Journal of Environmental Management i*, **211**, 1–8.
- Azhdarpoor A., Mohammadi P. and Dehghani M. (2015), Simultaneous removal of nutrients in a novel anaerobic– anoxic/aerobic sequencing reactor: removal of nutrients in a novel reactor, *International Journal of Environmental Science* and Technology, **13**, 543–550.
- Bettazzi E., Caffaz S., Vannini C. and Lubello C. (2010), Nitrite inhibition and intermediates effects on Anammox bacteria: A batch-scale experimental study, *Process Biochemistry*, **45**, 573–580.
- Brase L., Sanders T. and Dahnke K. (2018), Anthropogenic changes of nitrogen loads in a small river: external nutrient sources vs. internal turnover processes, *Isotopes in Environmental and Health Studies*, 54, 168–184.
- Chen Z.J., Meng Y.B., Sheng B.B., Zhou Z.B., Jin C. and Meng F.G. (2019), Linking Exoproteome Function and Structure to Anammox Biofilm Development, *Environmental Science & Technology*, **53**, 1490–1500.
- deGraaf A.A.V., deBruijn P., Robertson L.A., Jetten M.S.M. and Kuenen J.G. (1996), Autotrophic growth of anaerobic ammonium-oxidizing micro-organisms in a fluidized bed reactor, *Microbiology-Uk*, **142**, 2187–2196.
- Dietl A., Ferousi C., Maalcke W.J., Menzel A., de Vries S., Keltjens J.T., Jetten M.S.M., Kartal B. and Barends T.R.M. (2015), The inner workings of the hydrazine synthase multiprotein complex, *Nature*, **527**, 394–397.
- Egli K., Fanger U., Alvarez P.J.J., Siegrist H., van der Meer J.R. and Zehnder A.J.B. (2001), Enrichment and characterization of an anammox bacterium from a rotating biological contactor treating ammonium-rich leachate, *Archives of Microbiology*, **175**, 198–207.
- Isaka K., Sumino T. and Tsuneda S. (2007), High nitrogen removal performance at moderately low temperature utilizing anaerobic ammonium oxidation reactions, *Journal of Bioscience and Bioengineering*, **103**, 486–490.

- Jetten M.S.M., Wagner M., Fuerst J., van Loosdrecht M., Kuenen G. and Strous M. (2001), Microbiology and application of the anaerobic ammonium oxidation ('anammox') process, *Current Opinion in Biotechnology*, **12**, 283–288.
- Jin Y., Wang D.Q. and Zhang W.J. (2016), Use of bamboo charcoal reduced the cultivated anammox seed sludge dosage during the start-up period, *Desalination and Water Treatment*, **57**, 20248–20253.
- Kartal B., Maalcke W.J., de Almeida N.M., Cirpus I., Gloerich J., Geerts W., den Camp H.J.M.O., Harhangi H.R., Janssen-Megens E.M., Francoijs K.J., Stunnenberg H.G., Keltjens J.T., Jetten M.S.M. and Strous M. (2011), Molecular mechanism of anaerobic ammonium oxidation, *Nature*, **479**, 127–U159.
- Kartal B., Rattray J., van Niftrik L.A., van de Vossenberg J., Schmid M.C., Webb R.I., Schouten S., Fuerst J.A., Damste J.S.S., Jetten M.S.M. and Strous M. (2007), Candidatus "Anammoxoglobus propionicus" a new propionate oxidizing species of anaerobic ammonium oxidizing bacteria, *Systematic and Applied Microbiology*, **30**, 39–49.
- Khramenkov S.V., Kozlov M.N., Kevbrina M.V., Dorofeev A.G., Kazakova E.A., Grachev V.A., Kuznetsov B.B., Polyakov D.Y. and Nikolaev Y.A. (2013), A novel bacterium carrying out anaerobic ammonium oxidation in a reactor for biological treatment of the filtrate of wastewater fermented sludge, *Microbiology*, 82, 628–636.
- Kuenen J.G. (2008), Anammox bacteria: from discovery to application, *Nature Reviews Microbiology*, **6**, 320–326.
- Lackner S., Gilbert E.M., Vlaeminck S.E., Joss A., Horn H. and van Loosdrecht M.C.M. (2014), Full-scale partial nitritation/anammox experiences - An application survey, *Water Research*, 55, 292–303.
- Li J., Zhu W.Q., Dong H.Y. and Wang D. (2017), Performance and kinetics of ANAMMOX granular sludge with pH shock in a sequencing batch reactor, *Biodegradation*, **28**, 245–259.
- Liu X., Jin Y. and Zhang W. (2020), Effect of nitrite concentration on the growth and microbial diversity of anaerobic ammonia oxidation (anammox) sludge, *Desalination and Water Treatment*, **179**, 54–62.
- Liu X.N., Wang H.Q., Li H.X., Jin Y. and Zhang W.J. (2019), Carbon sequestration pathway of inorganic carbon in partial nitrification sludge, *Bioresource Technology*, **293**
- Lopez H., Puig S., Ganigue R., Ruscalleda M., Balaguer M.D. and Colprim J. (2008), Start-up and enrichment of a granular anammox SBR to treat high nitrogen load wastewaters, *Jour*nal of Chemical Technology and Biotechnology, **83**, 233–241.
- Miodoński S., Muszyński-Huhajło M., Zięba B., Ratkiewicz K. and Łagocka M. (2019), Fast start-up of anammox process with hydrazine addition, SN Applied Sciences, 1, 523.
- Ni S.Q., Gao B.Y., Wang C.C., Lin J.G. and Sung S.W. (2011), Fast start-up, performance and microbial community in a pilotscale anammox reactor seeded with exotic mature granules, *Bioresource Technology*, **102**, 2448–2454.
- Shen L.D., Hu A.H., Jin R.C., Cheng D.Q., Zheng P., Xu X.Y. and Hu B.L. (2012), Enrichment of anammox bacteria from three sludge sources for the startup of monosodium glutamate industrial wastewater treatment system, *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, **199**, 193–199.
- Strous M., Heijnen J.J., Kuenen J.G. and Jetten M.S.M. (1998), The sequencing batch reactor as a powerful tool for the study of slowly growing anaerobic ammonium-oxidizing

microorganisms, *Applied Microbiology and Biotechnology*, **50**, 589–596.

- Strous M., Kuenen J.G. and Jetten M.S.M. (1999), Key physiology of anaerobic ammonium oxidation, *Applied and Environmental Microbiology*, **65**, 3248–3250.
- van Niftrik L., Geerts W.J.C., van Donselaar E.G., Humbel B.M., Webb R.I., Fuerst J.A., Verkleij A.J., Jetten M.S.M. and Strous M. (2008), Linking ultrastructure and function in four genera of anaerobic ammonium-oxidizing bacteria: Cell plan, glycogen storage, and localization of cytochrome c proteins, *Journal of Bacteriology*, **190**, 708–717.
- Wang X., Yang R., Zhang Z., Wu J. and Chen S. (2019), Mass balance and bacterial characteristics in an in-situ full-scale swine wastewater treatment system occurring anammox process, *Bioresource Technology*, **292.**
- Wang Z., Peng Y.Z., Miao L., Cao T.H., Zhang F.Z., Wang S.Y. and Han J.H. (2016), Continuous-flow combined process of nitritation and ANAMMOX for treatment of landfill leachate, *Bioresource Technology*, **214**, 514–519.
- Wei Y., Jin Y. and Zhang W. (2020), Domestic Sewage Treatment Using a One-Stage ANAMMOX Process, International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health, **17**, 3284.
- Wen R., Jin Y. and Zhang W. (2020), Application of the Anammox in China-A Review, International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health., **17**.
- Xiao P.Y., Lu P.L., Zhang D.J., Han X.K. and Yang Q.X. (2015), Effect of trace hydrazine addition on the functional bacterial community of a sequencing batch reactor performing completely autotrophic nitrogen removal over nitrite, *Bioresource Technology*, **175**, 216–223.
- Yao Z.B., Cai Q., Zhang D.J., Xiao P.Y. and Lu P.L. (2013), The enhancement of completely autotrophic nitrogen removal over nitrite (CANON) by N2H4 addition, *Bioresource Technology*, **146**, 591–596.
- Yin Z.X., dos Santos C.E.D., Vilaplana J.G., Sobotka D., Czerwionka K., Damianovic M.H.R.Z., Xie L., Morales F.J.F. and Makinia J. (2016), Importance of the combined effects of dissolved oxygen and pH on optimization of nitrogen removal in anammox-enriched granular sludge, *Process Biochemistry*, **51**, 1274–1282.
- Zekker I., Kroon K., Rikmann E., Tenno T., Tomingas M., Vabamae P., Vlaeminck S.E. and Tenno T. (2012), Accelerating effect of hydroxylamine and hydrazine on nitrogen removal rate in moving bed biofilm reactor, *Biodegradation*, 23, 739–749.
- Zhang W., Wang H., Yue J. and Joseph D.R. (2015), Granular activated carbon as nucleus for formation of Anammox granules in an expanded granular-sludge-bed reactor, *Global NEST Journal*, **17**, 508–514.
- Zhang W.J., Wang D.Q. and Jin Y. (2018), Effects of inorganic carbon on the nitrous oxide emissions and microbial diversity of an anaerobic ammonia oxidation reactor, *Bioresource Technology*, 250, 124–130.